

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS
EASTERN DIVISION**

SIA HENRY, *et al.*, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

BROWN UNIVERSITY, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Case No.: 22-cv-00125

Hon. Matthew F. Kennelly

JULY 11, 2023, JOINT STATUS REPORT

I. Plaintiffs' Statement of Relevant Issues

Plaintiffs provide an update regarding the following five items for the Court. Plaintiffs seek the Court's immediate attention on only one item. Plaintiffs request the court extend the July 11 motion deadline regarding "AEO" designated documents until July 21, as the Parties have made significant progress and hope they can resolve all or nearly all the outstanding issues.

First, the Parties have agreed to a proposal for the end of written discovery and related dates. The Parties jointly submit the following proposed schedule, in light of the existing January 31, 2024 fact discovery cutoff:

Deadline to Propound Written Discovery Requests	September 30, 2023
Deadline to Respond to Written Discovery Requests	October 30, 2023
Deadline to file motions with respect to written discovery	November 15, 2023

Plaintiffs also believe that if deposition testimony after these deadlines reveals the existence of unproduced responsive documents, a Party should be entitled to demand production of such documents. The Parties are still discussing how and whether to address this in the joint schedule. The Parties will submit a stipulated schedule after the conference on July 24, 2023.

Second, the Parties have resolved their dispute about amending the Confidentiality Order, and will shortly be submitting a revised stipulated Confidentiality Order containing new provisions for using "Attorneys' Eyes Only" documents at depositions.

Third, in the last status report Plaintiffs raised an issue with Defendants producing "the Consensus Methodology elements as used in each year over the past 20 years" as well as the "full set of color books" from each Defendant. Dkt. No. 377 at 6. The Parties have engaged in fruitful negotiations since that last status report. Defendants have since produced more such documents and, if they have not already, have largely committed to producing any remaining such documents

in their possession. In addition, COFHE has committed to producing a full set of the color books for the relevant time period. Plaintiffs are currently inventorying what has been produced to determine any remaining gaps to be addressed.

Fourth, the Parties have largely resolved the AEO issues, after a series of fruitful discussions regarding certain Defendants' excessive AEO designations. It now appears that, for most Defendants, any continuing disputes regarding AEO designation can be resolved through the provisions of the Confidentiality Order. The same conclusion applies to Defendant Vanderbilt University, subject to that Defendant's agreement as of July 10 to conduct a re-review and re-designation of the AEO-designated documents produced to date, based on previously used search terms, and Plaintiffs' review of those revised designations. Defendant MIT is undertaking a further review of its documents with a commitment to reduce the number of AEO designations and will report back to Plaintiffs by July 18 on their progress. In an abundance of caution, Plaintiffs will be filing a motion to extend by ten (10) days their time to file a motion against MIT based on its excess designation of AEO documents. That motion to extend time will be unopposed.

Fifth, in the previous JSR of June 9, the Plaintiffs reported that they were working constructively with Defendants to resolve issues related to the meaning of data fields and completeness of the data productions in the Defendants' structured databases for Admissions and Financial Aid. This topic was also briefly addressed during the last status conference (at pp. 16-17). After meeting and conferring, the parties agreed by email on July 9 that this informal process will continue, with Defendants reserving their right to highlight certain issues they believe are more properly addressed through formal discovery.

II. Defendants' Statement of Relevant Issues

Defendants are not aware of any all-party discovery disputes or issues requiring the Court's attention.

Defendants believe that discovery is progressing appropriately. Five fact witnesses associated with Defendant schools have now been deposed, four additional depositions will occur this week, and over a dozen others have been scheduled for later this summer. Defendants also have noticed the first deposition to be taken of a named Plaintiff, and expect other notices to be served shortly. In recent weeks, Plaintiffs have served amended Interrogatory responses, and Defendants are currently reviewing those responses. Negotiations with various third-parties for discovery responsive to Rule 45 subpoenas are underway, and those discussions are making good progress. In particular, Defendants note that counsel for COFHE has committed to produce a full set of the "colorbooks" for the relevant time period, which we expect should alleviate Plaintiffs' questions about receiving a comprehensive set of those documents from each Defendant.

Defendants also note that the parties have recently amicably resolved their disagreements relating to a proposed amendment to the Confidentiality Order and a process for continuing to address any structured data questions that arise as Plaintiffs' analysis of Defendants' data moves forward. As to the level of "Attorneys' Eyes Only" designations, that issue has been resolved as to all Defendants except MIT. MIT is working diligently with Plaintiffs to resolve this issue. MIT does not oppose Plaintiffs' request for a 10-day extension to file a motion on the AEO issue, should one be necessary.

Dated: July 11, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Edward J. Normand

Devin “Vel” Freedman
Edward J. Normand
Richard Cipolla
Peter Bach-y-Rita
FREEDMAN NORMAND
FRIEDLAND LLP
99 Park Avenue
Suite 1910
New York, NY 10016
Tel.: 646-970-7513
vel@fnf.law
tnormand@fnf.law
rcipolla@fnf.law
pbachyrita@fnf.law

/s/ Robert D. Gilbert

Robert D. Gilbert
Elpidio Villarreal
Robert S. Raymar*
Sarah Schuster
Steven Magnusson
GILBERT LITIGATORS &
COUNSELORS, P.C.
11 Broadway, Suite 615
New York, NY 10004
Phone: (646) 448-5269
rgilbert@gilbertlitigators.com
pdvillarreal@gilbertlitigators.com
rraymar@gilbertlitigators.com
sschuster@gilbertlitigators.com
amarquez@gilbertlitigators.com
smagnusson@gilbertlitigators.com

* *Pro hac vice*

Eric L. Cramer
Caitlin G. Coslett
BERGER MONTAGUE PC
1818 Market Street, Suite 3600

By: /s/ Jon Roellke

Jon R. Roellke
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004-2541
Tel.: 202-739-5754
jon.roellke@morganlewis.com

Noah J. Kaufman
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
One Federal Street
Boston, MA 02210
Tel.: 617-341-7590
noah.kaufman@morganlewis.com

Counsel for Defendant Brown University

By: /s/ Deepti Bansal

Deepti Bansal
Alexander J. Kasner
COOLEY LLP
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Suite 700
Washington, DC 20004-2400
Tel.: 202-728-7027
dbansal@cooley.com
akasner@cooley.com

Matthew Kutcher
COOLEY LLP
110 N. Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606
Tel.: 312-881-6500
mkutcher@cooley.com

Counsel for Defendant California Institute of Technology

By: /s/ Amy Van Gelder

Philadelphia, PA 19103
Tel.: 215-875-3000
ecramer@bm.net
ccoslett@bm.net

Daniel J. Walker
Robert E. Litan
Ellen Noteware
Hope Brinn
BERGER MONTAGUE PC
2001 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20006
Tel.: 202-559-9745
rlitan@bm.net
dwalker@bm.net
enoteware@bm.net
hbrinn@bm.net

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Amy Van Gelder
John Kocoras
SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER &
FLOM LLP
155 N. Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606-1720
Tel.: 312-407-0508
amy.vangelder@skadden.com
john.kocoras@skadden.com

Karen Hoffman Lent
SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER &
FLOM LLP
One Manhattan West
Room 40-216
New York, NY 10001-8602
Tel.: 212-735-3276
karen.lent@skadden.com

*Counsel for Defendant The Trustees of
Columbia University in the City of New York*

By: /s/ Norm Armstrong
Norman Armstrong
Christopher C. Yook
KING & SPALDING LLP
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Suite 200
Washington, D.C. 20006
Tel.: 202-626-8979
narmstrong@kslaw.com
cyook@kslaw.com

Emily T. Chen
KING & SPALDING LLP
1185 Avenue of the Americas
34th Floor
New York, NY 10036
Tel.: 212-556-2224
echen@kslaw.com

Zachary T. Fardon
KING & SPALDING LLP
110 N Wacker Drive
Suite 3800
Chicago, IL 60606

Tel.: 312-764-6960
zfardon@kslaw.com

Counsel for Defendant Cornell University

By: /s/ Terri L. Mascherin
Terri L. Mascherin
Reid J. Schar
JENNER & BLOCK LLP
353 N. Clark Street,
Chicago, IL 60654-3456
Tel.: 312-222-9350
tmascherin@jenner.com
rschar@jenner.com

Ishan K. Bhabha
Douglas E. Litvack
Lauren J. Hartz
JENNER & BLOCK LLP
1099 New York Avenue, NW
Suite 900
Washington, DC 20001-4412
Tel.: 202-637-6327
ibhabha@jenner.com
dlitvack@jenner.com
lhartz@jenner.com

Counsel for Defendant Trustees of Dartmouth College

By: /s/ James A. Morsch
James A. Morsch
Jim.morsch@saul.com
SAUL EWING LLP
161 North Clark, Suite 4200
Chicago, IL 60601
Tel.: (312) 876-7100
Facsimile: (312) 876-0288
IL Attorney ID #6209558

Christopher D. Dusseault (pro hac vice)
cdusseault@gibsondunn.com
Jacqueline L. Sesia
jsesia@gibsondunn.com
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP
333 South Grand Avenue

Los Angeles, CA 90071
Tel.: (213) 229-7000

Counsel for Defendant Duke University

By: /s/ Tina M. Tabacchi
Tina M. Tabacchi
JONES DAY
110 North Wacker Drive
Suite 4800
Chicago, IL 60606
Tel.: 312-782-3939
tmtabacchi@jonesday.com

Craig A. Waldman
JONES DAY
51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20001-2113
Tel.: 202-879-3877
cwaldman@jonesday.com

Counsel for Defendant Emory University

By: /s/ Britt M. Miller
Britt M. Miller
Daniel T. Fenske
Jed W. Glickstein
MAYER BROWN LLP
71 South Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606
Tel.: 312-783-0600
bmiller@mayerbrown.com
dfenske@mayerbrown.com
jglickstein@mayerbrown.com

Counsel for Defendant Georgetown University

By: /s/ Jeffrey J. Bushofsky
Jeffrey J. Bushofsky
ROPES & GRAY LLP
191 North Wacker Drive 32nd Floor
Chicago, IL 60606-4302
Tel.: 312-845-1200
jeffrey.bushofsky@ropesgray.com

Chong S. Park

Samer M. Musallam
ROPES & GRAY LLP
2099 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20006-6807
Tel.: 202-508-4600
chong.park@ropesgray.com
samer.musallam@ropesgray.com

Counsel for Defendant Johns Hopkins University

By: /s/ Eric Mahr
Eric Mahr
Jan Rybnicek
Daphne Lin
FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS DERINGER
700 13th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20005
Tel.: 202-777-4500
eric.mahr@freshfields.com
jan.rybnicek@freshfields.com
daphne.lin@freshfields.com

Counsel for Defendant Massachusetts Institute of Technology

By: /s/ Scott D. Stein
Scott D. Stein
Kathleen L. Carlson
Benjamin R. Brunner
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
1 South Dearborn Street
Chicago, IL 60603
Tel.: 312-853-7520
sstein@sidley.com
kathleen.carlson@sidley.com
bbrunner@sidley.com

Counsel for Defendant Northwestern University

By: /s/ Robert A. Van Kirk
Robert A. Van Kirk
Jonathan B. Pitt
Sarah F. Kirkpatrick
Matthew D. Heins

Cole T. Wintheiser
WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP
680 Maine Avenue SW
Washington, D.C. 20024
Tel.: 202-434-5000
rvankirk@wc.com
skirkpatrick@wc.com
jpitt@wc.com
mheins@wc.com
cwintheiser@wc.com

James Peter Fieweger
MICHAEL BEST & FRIEDRICH LLP
444 West Lake Street
Suite 3200
Chicago, IL 60606
Tel.: 312-222-0800
jpfieweger@michaelbest.com

Counsel for Defendant University of Notre Dame du Lac

By: /s/ Seth Waxman
Seth Waxman
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE
AND DORR LLP
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20006
Tel.: 202-663-6800
seth.waxman@wilmerhale.com

David Gringer
Alan Schoenfeld
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE
AND DORR LLP
7 World Trade Center
250 Greenwich Street
New York, NY 10007
Tel.: 212-937-7294
david.gringer@wilmerhale.com
alan.schoenfeld@wilmerhale.com

Daniel Martin Feeney
Edward W. Feldman
MILLER SHAKMAN LEVINE & FELDMAN
LLP

180 North LaSalle Street
Suite 3600
Chicago, IL 60601
Tel.: 312-263-3700
dfeeney@millershakman.com
efeldman@millershakman.com

*Counsel for Defendant The Trustees of the
University of Pennsylvania*

By: /s/ Norm Armstrong
Norman Armstrong
Christopher C. Yook
KING & SPALDING LLP
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Suite 200
Washington, D.C. 20006
Tel.: 202-626-8979
narmstrong@kslaw.com
cyook@kslaw.com

Emily T. Chen
KING & SPALDING LLP
1185 Avenue of the Americas
34th Floor
New York, NY 10036
Tel.: 212-556-2224
echen@kslaw.com

Zachary T. Fardon
KING & SPALDING LLP
110 N Wacker Drive
Suite 3800
Chicago, IL 60606
Tel. 312-764-6960
zfardon@kslaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant William Marsh Rice
University*

By: /s/ J. Mark Gidley
J. Mark Gidley
WHITE & CASE LLP
701 Thirteenth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20005-3807
Tel.: 202-626-3600

mgidley@whitecase.com

Robert A. Milne
David H. Suggs
WHITE & CASE LLP
1221 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10020-1095
Tel.: 212-819-8200
rmilne@whitecase.com
dsuggs@whitecase.com

Counsel for Defendant Vanderbilt University

By: /s/ Charles A. Loughlin
Charles A. Loughlin
Benjamin F. Holt
Jamie Lee
Molly Pallman
Christopher Fitzpatrick
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
555 Thirteenth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20004-1109
Tel.: 202-637-5600
chuck.loughlin@hoganlovells.com
benjamin.holt@hoganlovells.com
jamie.lee@hoganlovells.com
molly.pallman@hoganlovells.com
chris.fitzpatrick@hoganlovells.com

Stephen Novack
Stephen J. Siegel
Serena G. Rabie
ARMSTRONG TEASDALE LLP
100 North Riverside Plaza, 15th Floor
Chicago, IL 60606-1501
Tel.: 312-419-6900
snovack@atllp.com
ssiegel@atllp.com
srabie@atllp.com

Counsel for Defendant Yale University